

1ST MEETING OF STF516 WG1
“Mandate M/462 Efficient energy use in fixed and mobile ICT networks”

The meeting session started at
10.30 am Tuesday, 23rd August 2016
and
ended no 1.00 pm Wednesday, 24th August 2016

23rd August: Room “Archives, 417”, Orange, 61 rue des Archives, 75003 Paris
24th August: Room “Republique, 520”, Orange, 61 rue des Archives, 75003 Paris

3rd arrondissement - closest Metro Rambuteau.

DRAFT MINUTES

Tuesday 23 rd August 2016 - Wednesday 24 th August 2016		
10.30am	1	Opening of session
		Mike Gilmore opened the session and welcomed the attendees.
	2	Administrative matters
	2.1	Attendance record/plan All
		Attendees: Rafaelle Bolla Gilles Dretsch Guillaume Gerard Mike Gilmore Apologies Simon Singh-Kang could not attend as he was still awaiting final contract. Mike Gilmore expects to visit him next week to review this meeting and assist in final contract discussion. Document 01-09 explains the issues being discussed with TC CABLE. The attendees introduced themselves and their backgrounds.
	2.2	STF matters
		A query regarding the 2nd CfE was submitted to Alberto Berrini. He answered as follows “We can issue the 2nd CfE as soon as each WG will have defined the work plan to cover 100% of each task. Part of this may be done by extending the contract of the current providers. If they do not have all the necessary expertise, then we need to define a profile of the providers we are looking for and on which deliverables they should work.” Guillaume Gerard advised that he would be unable to extend his official “day” contribution from Orange. Each of the work items were addressed against this advice.
	2.2.1	Contact list All
		Contact points confirmed
	2.2.2	Contracts and other matters All https://portal.etsi.org/STF/STFs/Summary.aspx
		Noted
	2.2.3	ETSI STF site All https://portal.etsi.org/STF/stfs/STFHomePages/STF516
	2.2.4	Team Photo All
		A photo was taken of the attendees present. This will form part of collage photo of all STF516 experts which will be placed on the STF web-page.
	2.2.5	ETSI TAM All

		<p>TAM is not being used in the same way as STF 439. However, experts recorded the “day” commitment using the STF516 matrix. This is recorded in Annex A to these Minutes. This Matrix was also used to calculate possible shifts of resource for the 2nd CfE.</p> <p>The WG2 meeting in September is to be held at Sophia Antipolis and the TAM system will be implemented there to record activity against the Matrix allocation.</p> <p>However, this TAM data is not the basis for invoicing in accordance with the various contract awards.</p>	
	3	<p>Documents Check via</p> <p>ETSI STF 516 DocBox https://docbox.etsi.org/STF/STF516_M462_EnergyEfficiency</p> <p>ETSI STF 516 WG1 DocBox https://docbox.etsi.org/STF/STF516_M462_EnergyEfficiency/STFworkarea/WG1/Documents</p> <p>Noted</p>	All
	4	<p>Approve Agenda (document 01/01)</p> <p>Approved as document 01/01a</p>	All
	5	Confirm Minutes of Meeting xx	All
	6	Actions from Meeting xx	All
	7	Matters Arising from Meeting xx	All
	8	Review Minutes of Kick-off Meeting (document 01/02)	All
	8.1	Questions	All
		Noted - no questions	
	9	Incoming Reports	
	9.1	ETSI STF 516 Steering Group	
	9.2	ETSI ATTU (document 01/03)	
		<p>The response to 01/03 is recorded in 01/03a</p> <p>Most questions are answered but STF 516 WG1 will have to propose changes to document titles in its report from this meeting.</p>	
	9.3	ETSI CABLE (document 01/03)	
		No response has been received hence the discussions with Simon-Singh-Kang in item 2.1.	
	9.4	ETSI STF 516 WG2	
		Meeting 1: 14 th /15 th September in Sophia-Antipolis, France	
	9.5	ETSI STF 516 WG3	
		Meeting 1: 2 nd October in Helsinki, Finland	
	9.6	Other ESO input	
	9.6.1	CEN/CLC/ETSI Mandate M/462 CG (document 01/04)	MG
		Noted - this document contains timescales for STF 516 and STF Stage 2. See 10.x.4 for individual timescales	
		The Mandate report is updated every six-months. Next edition December 2016.	
	9.6.2	CEN/CLC/ETSI CG GDC (document 01/06, 01/07 and 01/08)	MG
		Noted	
	9.6.3	CLC TC215 WG3 (see 9.6.2)	MG
		Noted	
	9.6.4	ISG OEU	GG
		No issues	
	9.6.5	JRC CoC (document 01/05)	MG
		Noted	
	9.7	Other international standards input	
	9.7.1	ITU-T SG5	GG
		No issues	

	9.7.2	ISO/IEC JTC1 SC39 (see 9.6.2)	MG
		No issues	
	9.8	Other reports	
	9.8.1	Report from GreenGrid	
		No issues	
	9.8.2	Extension of list of inputs	
		None noted	
	10	Development of STF516 WG1 documents	
	10.1	EN 305 174-1 Broadband Deployment and Lifecycle Resource Management; Overview, common and generic aspects.	MG 100% cover
		Based on the answers in 01/03a.... It was decided that the TS 105 174-1 V.1.2.1 could be translated into a draft suitable for EN status	
	10.1.1	Introduction	
		Needs to be amended to include the full series including 305 174-8 covering waste and EoL	
	10.1.2	Scope	
		Needs to be amended to include the full series including 305 174-8 covering waste and EoL The ToR draft Scope was "The present document gives an overview of this multi-part deliverable covering energy management and sustainable broadband deployment."	
	10.1.3	Action	
		GD to provide MG with Word version of GS OEU 018. Project already has 100% coverage so no 2CfE required WD to be prepared	GD MG
	10.1.4	Check development schedule	
		WD to be produced w/e 02/09/2016 Comment deadline 07/10/2016 8 month gap before Stable draft 30/06/2017	
	10.2	EN 305 174-2 Broadband Deployment and Lifecycle Resource Management; ICT Sites	MG 19% cover
		The text of TS 105 174-2 V1.1.3 appears not to have been published MG to check with Dominique Roche The current text is potentially largely covered by CLC/TR 50600-99-1 and other aspects of EN 50600 series This needs to be checked. Mike Gilmore to contact Mark Acton of CBRE (Editor of both CLC/TR 50600-99-1 and CoC DCEE BP) to see if interested in 2CfE. Otherwise GG will transfer some activity from D04. There is an 81% (12,879 euro) opportunity for full coverage. Once this check has been completed an attempt to determine what the "requirements" of the EN will be which will allow an Introduction and Scope to be produced.	
	10.2.1	Introduction	
		See above	
	10.2.2	Scope	
		See above The ToR draft Scope was "The present document details measures that shall be taken to improve Lifecycle Resource Management (e.g. energy efficiency) in ICT sites (including data centres) for broadband deployment."	
	10.2.3	Action	
		See above The differences/equivalence between ICT sites and data centres is to be clarified.	
	10.2.4	Check development schedule	
		Skeleton w/e 02/09/2016 Identify additional resource via transfer of existing expertise of new expertise in 2 nd CFE	

		<p>WD to be produced w/e 04/12/2016 Comment deadline 06/01/2017 2 month gap before Stable draft 31/03/2017</p> <p>This represents the critical path document of the WG1 package.</p>	
	10.3	<p>EN 305 174-5-1 Broadband Deployment and Lifecycle Resource Management; Customer network infrastructures; Homes (single-tenant)</p>	MG 19% cover
		<p>It is unclear how any of the information in the published TR 105 174-5-1 - which currently is very tutorial in nature - can be converted into an EN. We can certainly mandate the application of EN 305 174-8 One possible solution would be to "standardise" limits for energy consumption such as the BB CoC. Is this what TC ATTM wishes? Clarification is required. Once we have clarification, additional expertise will be required as 2nd CfE.</p>	
	10.3.1	<p>Introduction</p> <p>Nothing to be done at this stage</p>	
	10.3.2	<p>Scope</p> <p>Nothing to be done at this stage</p> <p>The ToR draft Scope was "This document describes practices which shall be taken to improve eco-efficiency of Customer network infrastructures; Homes (single-tenant) for broadband deployment."</p>	
	10.3.3	<p>Action</p> <p>Nothing to be done at this stage</p>	
	10.3.4	<p>Check development schedule</p> <p>Skeleton w/e 04/12/2016 Identify additional resource via transfer of existing expertise of new expertise in 2nd CFE WD to be produced w/e 06/01/2017 or, if delays in 2nd CfE occur, w/e 03/02/2017 Comment deadline 03/02/2017 or 03/03/2017 5 or 4 month gap before Stable draft 30/06/2017.</p>	
	10.4	<p>DEN/ATTM-010: EN 305 174-8 Broadband Deployment and Lifecycle Resource Management; Management of end of life of ICT equipment (ICT waste/End of life)</p>	MG-GD 50% cover
		<p>Document 03/10 (GS OEU 018) was reviewed. A large part of the document is tutorial and contains a review/interpretation of existing regulations and directives. This cannot be included in an EN. The remaining recommendations may be able to be written as requirements.</p>	
	10.4.1	<p>Introduction</p> <p>See above</p>	
	10.4.2	<p>Scope</p> <p>See above</p> <p>The ToR draft Scope was "The present document defines processes in relation to management of end of life of ICT equipment."</p>	
	10.4.3	<p>Action</p> <p>Following receipt of a Word version of GS OEU 018, Mike Gilmore will produce a Working Draft based upon the above approach. Gilles Dretsch believes that an additional expert (to at least review the text) would be useful under 2nd CfE. This is listed as a 15% additional activity in Annex A, Table A.2. No additional input is perceived to be necessary so the 14,630 euros may be used elsewhere.</p>	
	10.4.4	<p>Check development schedule</p> <p>WD to be produced w/e 02/09/2016</p>	

		<p>Comment deadline 07/10/2016 5 month gap before internal deadline of 31/03/2017 to allow review by 2nd CfE person. Stable draft 30/06/2017</p>	
	10.5	<p>EN 305 200-1 Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; General requirements</p>	<p>MG-GG-RB 69% cover</p>
		<p>Title change proposal: Energy management; Operational infrastructures; Global KPIs; General requirements</p>	
		<p>The text of ES 205 200-1 V1.2.1 is the basis of the work The project can be handled with the 1st CfE proposal. This would leave 3,328 euros unspent.</p>	
	10.5.1	<p>Introduction</p>	
		<p>No changes required</p>	
	10.5.2	<p>Scope</p>	
		<p>No changes required</p> <p>The ToR draft Scope was “The present document describes the energy management landscape of the operational infrastructures of broadband deployment addressed by this multi-part deliverable, their inter-relationship and boundaries. It specifies the following aspects for Global Key Performance Indicators (KPI_{EM}) in relation to energy management for these infrastructures: Common objectives in relation to: Energy consumption; Task efficiency; Energy re-use; Renewable energy. General requirements for all KPIs specified in the ES 205 200-2 series in relation to infrastructure scalability.”</p>	
	10.5.3	<p>Action</p>	
		<p>A WD can be prepared by Mike Gilmore. Mention of EN 50600-4-1 is to be made which follows the same approach. The differences/equivalence between ICT sites and data centres is to be clarified. In all parts terminology clarifications in 205 200-3 need to be employed in the text of all part 305 200 documents.</p>	
	10.5.4	<p>Check development schedule</p>	
		<p>WD to be produced w/e 09/09/2016 Comment deadline 16/10/2016 5 month gap. Stable draft 31/03/2017</p>	
	10.6	<p>EN 305 200-2-1 Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; ICT Sites</p>	<p>MG-GG 42% cover</p>
		<p>Title change proposal: Energy management; Operational infrastructures; Global KPIs; Specific requirements: ICT sites</p>	
		<p>The text of ES 205 200-2-1 V1.2.1 is the basis of the work. It was noted that KPI_{TE} and KPI_{REN} require harmonisation with that of the proposed EN 305 200-3. While the project could be handled with the 1st CfE proposal it would be useful to add 23% input from Rafaele Bolla as 2nd CfE. This would still leave 3,640 euros unspent.</p>	
	10.6.1	<p>Introduction</p>	
		<p>No changes required</p>	
	10.6.2	<p>Scope</p>	
		<p>No changes required</p> <p>The ToR draft Scope was “The present document specifies Objective KPIs and a Global Key Performance Indicator (KPI_{EM}) for performance of energy management in operator data centres (ODC), operator sites (OS) and customer data centres (CDC) in accordance with objectives and requirements defined in EN 305 200-1.”</p>	

	10.6.3	Action	
		A WD can be prepared by Mike Gilmore - noting the changes to <i>KPI_{TE}</i> and <i>KPI_{REN}</i> . It is proposed to reference EN 50600-4-2 and EN 50600-4-3 and only identify differences in objective KPI specification.	
	10.6.4	Check development schedule	
		WD to be produced w/e 09/09/2016 Comment deadline 16/10/2016 5 month gap. Stable draft 31/03/2017	
	10.7	EN 305 200-2-2 Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Fixed Broadband access networks	MG--RB 100% cover
		Title change proposal: Energy management; Operational infrastructures; Global KPIs; Specific requirements: Fixed Broadband access networks	
		The text of ES 205 200-2-2 V1.0.0 is the basis of the work. This document is in Final Draft and is not approved. It was noted that <i>KPI_{TE}</i> needs at least to address "energy per bit delivered" and that some rework was necessary. It is considered that this is non-trivial and some of the unused spend on EN 305 200-1 and 305 200-2-1 could be relocated to this work as part of the 2 nd CfE allowing Raffaele Bolla to provide additional activity. It also could require additional operational expertise under 2 nd CfE which could funded from other unspent allocations.	
	10.7.1	Introduction	
		Changes required to reflect "work done".	
	10.7.2	Scope	
		Changes required to reflect "work done" The ToR draft Scope was "The present document specifies Global Key Performance Indicators (<i>KPI_{EM}</i>) in relation to energy management of fixed broadband access networks, e.g. IP-DSLAM, OLT and MSAN. It does not take into account the ONU in case of FTTB configurations."	
	10.7.3	Action	
		Skeleton can be produced by Mike Gilmore leaving the <i>KPI_{TE}</i> ffs	
	10.7.4	Check development schedule	
		Skeleton w/e 09/09/2016 Identify additional resource via transfer of existing expertise of new expertise in 2 nd CFE WD to be produced w/e 06/01/2017 or, if delays in 2 nd CfE occur, w/e 03/02/2017 Comment deadline 03/02/2017 or 03/03/2017 5 or 4 month gap before Stable draft 30/06/2017.	
	10.8	EN 305 200-2-3 Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Mobile access networks	MG-RB 37% cover
		Title change proposal: Energy management; Operational infrastructures; Global KPIs; Specific requirements: Mobile access networks	
		It is felt that this document requires additional experts (perhaps as many as 2) to complete the resource allocation as part of the 2 nd CfE.	
	10.8.1	Introduction	
		Nothing to be done at this stage	
	10.8.2	Scope	
		Nothing to be done at this stage The ToR draft Scope was "The present document defines a Global KPI (DCEM) for classification of energy management performance in data centres (12/2014: ICT sites) based on the Global and objective KPIs defined in the EN 305 200-2-1 standard. Performance of energy management has 9 levels."	

	10.8.3	Action	
		Nothing to be done at this stage	
	10.8.4	Check development schedule	
		Skeleton w/e 09/09/2016 Identify additional resource via transfer of existing expertise of new expertise in 2 nd CfE WD to be produced w/e 06/01/2017 or, if delays in 2 nd CfE occur, w/e 03/02/2017 Comment deadline 03/02/2017 or 03/03/2017 5 or 4 month gap before Stable draft 30/06/2017.	
	10.9	EN 305 200-2-4 Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Cable access networks	MG-SK 100% cover
		Title change proposal: Energy management; Operational infrastructures; Global KPIs; Specific requirements: Cable access networks	
	10.9.1	Introduction	
		See item 2.1	
	10.9.2	Scope	
		See item 2.1 The ToR draft Scope was "The present document specifies Global Key Performance Indicators (<i>KPI_{EM}</i>) in relation to energy management for cable operator networks."	
	10.9.3	Action	
		See item 2.1	
	10.9.4	Check development schedule	
		See item 2.1	
	10.10	EN 305 200-3 Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Global KPI for ICT Sites	MG-GG 85% cover
		Designation and title change proposal: EN 305 200-3-1: Energy management; Operational infrastructures; Global KPIs; Specific requirements: ICT sites: DCEM	
		The text of ES 205 200-3 V0.0.7 is the basis of the work. It is considered that this is straightforward. 2 nd CfE could include a 15% involvement by Raffaele Bolla taking the task allocation to 100%.	
	10.10.1	Introduction	
		No changes required	
	10.10.2	Scope	
		No changes required The ToR draft Scope was "The present document defines a Global KPI (DCEM) for classification of energy management performance in data centres (12/2014: ICT sites) based on the Global and objective KPIs defined in the EN 305 200-2-1 standard. Performance of energy management has 9 levels.."	
	10.10.3	Action	
		Mike Gilmore can prepare Working Draft.	
	10.10.4	Check development schedule	
		WD to be produced w/e 09/09/2016 Comment deadline 16/10/2016 5 month gap. Stable draft 31/03/2017	
	11	Outgoing Reports	
	11.1	Report to STF 516 Steering Group	
		Mike Gilmore report to Alberto Berrini and Dominique Roche Regarding transfer of finds across projects and also 2 nd CfE Deadlines of work to be undertaken Pending on-time implementation and agreement of 2 nd CfE and contracts we are not concerned about resources.	
	11.2	Other reports	

	11.2.1	Extension of list of outputs	
		None	
	12	DoNM and AOB	
	12.1	Date of next meeting	
		Meeting 2: 14 th /15 th December 2016 (1,5 days starting at 11.00) or 25 th /26 th January 2017 (1,5 days starting at 11.00) Location: Sophia Antipolis, France.	
	12.2	AOB	
		None	

ANNEX A

Data provided by Alberto Berrini
Notional man-days in yellow highlight

Table A.1

Task	Title	EUR	ETSI Days	% activity and notional days allocated						Total Task
				RB	MG	GG	S K	GD		
D01	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; ICT Sites EN 305 174-2	15,900	27		19					19
D02	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; General requirements EN 305 200-1	10,400	17	4	19	23	2.5			68
D03	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; ICT Sites EN 305 200-2-1	10,400	17		19	23	2.5			42
D04	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Global KPI for ICT Sites EN 305 200-3	15,900	27		19	66	11			85
D06	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Fixed Broadband access networks EN 305 200-2-2	15,900		9	67					100
D07	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Cable access networks EN 305 200-2-4	15,900			19		81			100
D08	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Mobile access networks EN 305 200-2-3	31,300		9	19					37
D10	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; Customer network infrastructures; Homes (single-tenant) EN 305 174-5-1	15,900			19					19
D11	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; Overview, common and generic aspects. EN 305 174-1	10,000			100					100
D13	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; Management of end of life of ICT equipment (ICT waste/End of life) EN 305 174-8	41,800			14			36	25	50

Table A.2
CHANGES SHOWN IN RED

Task	Title	EUR	ETSI Days	% activity and notional days allocated							Total Task	Remainder	Unused (EUR)
				RB	MG	GG	S K	GD	New experts				
D01	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; ICT Sites EN 305 174-2	15,900	27		19					1 poss 81%	100	0	
D02	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; General requirements EN 305 200-1	10,400	17	4	19	23					68	32	3,328
D03	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; ICT Sites EN 305 200-2-1	10,400	17	23	19	23					65	35	3,640
D04	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Global KPI for ICT Sites EN 305 200-3	15,900	27	15	19	66					100	0	
D06	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Fixed Broadband access networks EN 305 200-2-2	15,900		9	67						100	0	Add in unused to cover both RB and possible extra expert
D07	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Cable access networks EN 305 200-2-4	15,900			19		81				100	0	
D08	Energy management; Global KPIs; Operational infrastructures; Specific requirements; Mobile access networks EN 305 200-2-3	31,300		9	19					2 op (26%)	63	37	11,581
D10	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; Customer network infrastructures; Homes (single-tenant) EN 305 174-5-1	15,900			19						19	81	12,879
D11	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; Overview, common and generic aspects. EN 305 174-1	10,000			100						100	0	
D13	Broadband Deployment & Lifecycle Resource Management; Management of end of life of ICT equipment (ICT waste/End of life) EN 305 174-8	41,800			14			36		1 e-waste (15%)	65	35	14,630